

Mathematical Journal of Okayama University

Volume 22, Issue 1

1980

Article 6

JUNE 1980

Large Carmichael numbers

Samuel S.*

Wagstaff Jr.†

*University Of Illinois

†Northern Illinois University

Copyright ©1980 by the authors. *Mathematical Journal of Okayama University* is produced by
The Berkeley Electronic Press (bepress). <http://escholarship.lib.okayama-u.ac.jp/mjou>

LARGE CARMICHAEL NUMBERS

SAMUEL S. WAGSTAFF, JR.

1. Introduction. A *Carmichael number* is an odd composite number n for which $a^{n-1} \equiv 1 \pmod{n}$ for each integer a relatively prime to n . Many mathematicians believe that there are infinitely many Carmichael numbers, but this conjecture has never been proved. Erdős [4] conjectured that the number $C(x)$ of Carmichael numbers up to x satisfies $C(x) > x^{1-\varepsilon}$ for each positive ε and all sufficiently large x .

Yorinaga [10] has exhibited many quite large Carmichael numbers, thereby supporting the conjecture. He used four different techniques to produce these numbers. In the present work, we use his second method, that of universal forms due to Chernick [3], to find some much larger Carmichael numbers. Our largest one has 321 decimal digits.

In Section 4, we discuss the search for composite n for which $\phi(n)$ divides $n-1$, where ϕ is Euler's function.

2. The universal forms of Chernick. For integers $k \geq 3$ and $m \geq 1$ define

$$U_k(m) = (6m+1)(12m+1) \prod_{i=1}^{k-2} (9 \cdot 2^i m + 1).$$

Chernick [3] proved that $U_3(m)$ is a Carmichael number whenever all three of the factors $6m+1$, $12m+1$, $18m+1$ are prime. Furthermore, he showed that if $k \geq 4$ and 2^{k-1} divides m , then $U_k(m)$ is a Carmichael number whenever each of its k factors is prime.

Chernick's sufficient conditions for $U_k(m)$ to be a Carmichael number are not necessary conditions. For example,

$$172081 = U_3(5) = 31 \cdot 61 \cdot 91$$

is a Carmichael number even though 91 is composite.

Let a_1, \dots, a_k be positive integers and let b_1, \dots, b_k be non-zero integers. Let $P(x)$ denote the number of $m \leq x$ for which $a_i m + b_i$ is prime for each $i = 1, \dots, k$. The strong form of the Prime k -tuples Conjecture says that if no prime divides

$$(1) \quad \prod_{i=1}^k (a_i m + b_i)$$

for every m , then there is a positive constant c such that $P(x) \sim cx/\log^k x$

as $x \rightarrow \infty$. Like the conjectures about the growth rate of $C(x)$, the Prime k -tuples Conjecture is supported by numerical data and a heuristic argument, but it has never been proved (except for $k=1$). The heuristic value of the constant c may be extracted from [1].

Chernick [3] called a form (1) *universal* if its value is a Carmichael number for every m for which each of the k factors is prime. He gave many examples of universal forms—not just $U_k(m)$.

The strong form of the Prime k -tuples Conjecture and Chernick's result about $U_k(m)$ together imply that for each $k \geq 3$ there is a positive constant c_k such that for all sufficiently large x , there are at least $c_k x^{1/k} / \log^k x$ Carmichael numbers $\leq x$ with exactly k prime factors (and, in fact, of the form $U_k(m)$). Examination of tables of Carmichael numbers (such as [10]) indicates that most of them do not have the form $U_k(m)$. Thus, it is very likely true that for $k \geq 3$ there are many more than $O(x^{1/k} / \log^k x)$ Carmichael numbers $\leq x$ having exactly k prime factors.

3. Numerical results. We used a sieve to compute some numbers m for which $6m+1$, $12m+1$, and $18m+1$ are all primes. We found such m of 15 to 16 digits very readily. It took a little effort to discover five more of them with 41 and 42 digits. All of these numbers are listed in Table 1. They yield Carmichael numbers $U_3(m)$ of about 50 and 126 digits, respectively. Then we found the Carmichael number

| | | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| 5 | 10097651 | 43959249 | 35442924 | 80932774 | 56279161 |
| 66422617 | 58239613 | 10579841 | 88849784 | 22849780 | 91128590 |
| 18356898 | 74002783 | 53571488 | 38474305 | 31105418 | 73196218 |
| 73938057 | 88336374 | 85286596 | 13137137 | 81439007 | 23170631 |
| 94923024 | 77317009 | 21197794 | 18509950 | 24840245 | 83806981 |
| 77310433 | 20215974 | 89437261 | 95369370 | 82075885 | 79386408 |
| | | | | | 51976601 |

of 321 decimal digits, which is $U_3(m)$ for the 106 digit

| | | | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-----------|
| $m = 73$ | 28517132 | 62373770 | 42833051 | 15698260 | 79825001 | 98696237 |
| | 26846779 | 39558839 | 14228225 | 25876339 | 63462201 | 59279282 |
| | | | | | | 85851850, |

and which seems to be largest known Carmichael number at the present time. The previous record was the 77 digit Carmichael number of Hill [11].

When we searched for m such that $6m+1$, $12m+1$, $18m+1$, and $36m+1$ are all prime, we considered only those m which were divisible by 256. We made this restriction to insure that if $72m+1$, $144m+1$, etc., happened to be prime as well, then the appropriate $U_k(m)$ would be a Carmichael number. Table 2 lists some m for which $U_4(m)$ is Carmichael,

but for which $72m+1$ is composite. In Table 3, we give the m 's which we found for which $U_5(m)$ is Carmichael. We discovered only one value of m , namely

$$m=1810081824371200,$$

which makes $U_6(m)$ a Carmichael number. The Carmichael number is

$$\begin{array}{cccccccc} 17013 & 42440919 & 43763695 & 53227755 & 50557528 & 57171386 & 19698240 \\ 48592960 & 03337783 & 47855414 & 62105336 & 02967795 & 96185601 \end{array}$$

of 101 decimal digits. It is undoubtedly the largest known Carmichael number with more than three prime divisors.

In order to demonstrate that the large numbers described in this section really are Carmichael numbers, one must prove that various numbers of the form $rm+1$ are prime. In the case of the 321 digit Carmichael number, we used the following theorem to prove primality of the three factors.

Theorem 1 (Brillhart and Selfridge [2]). *Let $N-1 = \prod p_i^{\alpha_i}$. If for each p_i there exists an a_i such that $a_i^{N-1} \equiv 1 \pmod{N}$, but $a_i^{(N-1)/p_i} \not\equiv 1 \pmod{N}$, then N is prime.*

We arranged the sieve so that only those m with a small largest prime factor would be examined. The factorization of our 106 digit m is

$$m=2 \cdot 3^3 \cdot 5^2 \cdot 7 \cdot 577 \cdot 1009^{33}.$$

Hence, it is easy to use Theorem 1 to prove that $6m+1$, $12m+1$, and $18m+1$ are primes.

The other numbers $rm+1$ were proved prime by an algorithm of Selfridge and Wunderlich [8] which was implemented by them at Northern Illinois University. Their program uses factors of $N+1$ as well as those of $N-1$ in proving N is prime, and does not require a complete factorization of either number to complete the proof. We helped the program by insuring that m (and hence $N-1$) would factor completely with little effort. In this manner, more than 1000 prime proofs of numbers of about 17 digits were performed in a few minutes.

4. Does $\phi(n)$ ever divide $n-1$ properly? Lehmer [6] asked whether there are any composite numbers n for which $\phi(n)$ divides $n-1$. The question remains unsettled. Kishore [5] announced a proof that any such n must have at least 13 distinct prime factors. It is clear that any composite n with $\phi(n) \mid n-1$ must be a Carmichael number. Yorinaga [10] found 8 Carmichael numbers with 13 or more prime factors. These appear

to be the only known Carmichael numbers with so many prime divisors. We determined by calculation that $\phi(n) \mid n-1$ for none of these numbers.

We considered the possibility of searching for m for which $n = U_k(m)$ is a Carmichael number and $k \geq 13$. One might expect such n to be good candidates for $\phi(n) \mid n-1$. One difficulty with this approach is that, assuming the strong form of the Prime k -tuples Conjecture, such numbers ought to be quite rare. Indeed, there should be only $O(x/\log^k x)$ values of $m \leq x$ for which $U_k(m)$ is Carmichael, and we have $k \geq 13$ here. Such values of m should be a bit harder to find than arithmetic progressions of 13 primes (because the sieve for $U_k(m)$ is more complicated), and only recently [9] have seventeen primes in arithmetic progression been discovered. A more fundamental difficulty with this method of seeking composite n with $\phi(n) \mid n-1$ is expressed in the following theorem.

Theorem 2 (Pomerance). *If each of the $k \geq 3$ factors of $n = U_k(m)$ is prime (so that n is a Carmichael number), then $\phi(n)$ does not divide $n-1$.*

Proof. We have

$$\frac{n-1}{\phi(n)} < \frac{n}{\phi(n)} = \left(1 + \frac{1}{6m}\right) \left(1 + \frac{1}{12m}\right) \prod_{i=1}^{k-2} \left(1 + \frac{1}{9 \cdot 2^i m}\right),$$

so that

$$\log \left(\frac{n-1}{\phi(n)} \right) < \frac{1}{6m} + \frac{1}{12m} + \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{9 \cdot 2^i m} = \frac{13}{36m} \leq \frac{13}{36} < \log 2.$$

Hence, $n-1 < 2\phi(n)$, and $n-1$ cannot be a multiple of $\phi(n)$.

Chernick [3] explained how one may construct universal forms (1) with $k=3$ and 4 by solving congruences. He also described a method [3, Theorem 3] of producing a universal form (1) from any given Carmichael number of k prime factors. In the latter construction, the b_i of (1) are the prime divisors of the given Carmichael number. We will explain why this method is unlikely to produce a Carmichael number n of the form (1) with $m > 0$ for which $\phi(n) \mid n-1$.

Suppose that (1) is a universal form with $k \geq 3$ and positive integers a_i and b_i . (The a_i and b_i are positive integers in Chernick's [3] constructions.) Assume that m is a positive integer for which each of the k factors in (1) is prime. Suppose that the value n of (1) for this m satisfies $\phi(n) \mid n-1$. Then

$$2 \leq (n-1)/\phi(n) < n/\phi(n) = \prod_{i=1}^k (1 + (a_i m + b_i - 1)^{-1})$$

$$\leq \prod_{i=1}^k (1 + (a_i m)^{-1}),$$

and we have

$$\log 2 < \sum_{i=1}^k 1/(a_i m) = \frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^k \frac{1}{a_i}.$$

Hence

$$(2) \quad m < \frac{1}{\log 2} \sum_{i=1}^k \frac{1}{a_i}.$$

This shows that k must be large and the a_i small in order for there to be even one positive value of m for which (1) satisfies $\phi(n) \mid n-1$. However, the a_i in Chernick's construction are rather large.

Pomerance [7] has shown that if $\phi(n) \mid n-1$ and n has exactly k prime factors, then $n < k^{2^k}$. This inequality shows that for any form (1) there are only finitely many values of m for which each factor $a_i m + b_i$ is prime and the value n of (1) satisfies $\phi(n) \mid n-1$. Indeed, any such m must be less than

$$(k^{2^k} / \prod_{i=1}^k a_i)^{1/k}.$$

But this inequality is not as sharp as (2).

Where, then, should one look for composite n with $\phi(n) \mid n-1$? Of the four methods which Yarinaga [10] describes, the one best suited for this purpose seems to be his Method III, which is a direct search of square-free numbers whose prime factors are drawn from a small set of specified primes.

Acknowledgments. The author thanks Carl Pomerance for supplying Theorem 2. He is grateful to John Selfridge and Marvin Wunderlich for the use of their prime proving program. Most of the calculations for this paper were performed at the Computer Center of Northern Illinois University.

Table 1

Some m with $6m+1$, $12m+1$, and $18m+1$ all prime.

| | | | | | |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|----------|----------|
| 925968953850065 | 925968953854121 | 925968953858280 | 925968953858935 | | |
| 925968953862470 | 8550768560768681 | 8550768560769871 | 8550768560772035 | | |
| 8550768560773876 | 8550768560778451 | 8550768560778845 | 8550768560784495 | | |
| 8550768560790456 | 8522851273339146 | 8522851273349646 | 8522851273351855 | | |
| 8522851273354456 | 8522851273354481 | 8522851273355841 | 8522851273360266 | | |
| 8522851273361266 | 8522851273362166 | 8522851273365081 | 9510693751419300 | | |
| 9510693751424610 | 9510693751425636 | 9510693751431925 | 9510693751437311 | | |
| 9510693751439811 | 9510693751443160 | 9510693751445145 | 9510693751446670 | | |
| 1 | 17460813 | 84297126 | 18283788 | 96431395 | 52776760 |
| 1 | 44492282 | 01171123 | 49553264 | 82414660 | 41285720 |
| 1 | 47699719 | 59277571 | 73633936 | 51396213 | 79085480 |
| 3 | 74373319 | 56845198 | 89317764 | 04948781 | 96178490 |
| 11 | 72784255 | 93238765 | 61052131 | 96981236 | 70218170 |

Table 2

Some m with $rm+1$ prime for $r=6, 12, 18$, and 36 .

| | | | |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| 32016531278336 | 61778652920320 | 85863288288256 | 90269095925760 |
| 103431922671616 | 118520551937536 | 129949692862976 | 161980645770240 |
| 169850734699520 | 216684974643200 | 223486317857280 | 265131346677760 |
| 266728027023360 | 295903497402880 | 334697679219200 | 353997424132096 |
| 385291843847680 | 421490647515136 | 437534194639360 | 461654369021440 |
| 475388910342656 | 486800024231936 | 574050879246336 | 621204455259136 |
| 633936693369856 | 643140267916800 | 654783157985280 | 699233193632256 |
| 702524415376896 | 736415243357696 | 737581335068160 | 739685862775296 |
| 754305789101056 | 763983732228096 | 776497070614016 | 795558858649600 |
| 836065608901120 | 841031284775936 | 852887923987456 | 894056008936960 |
| 899392011640320 | 909703476323840 | 929150012816896 | 944238127024640 |
| 967402868490240 | 983535005620736 | 986882883764736 | 998857986356736 |
| 1030750388614656 | 1043477476143616 | 1059843449686016 | 1088689282832896 |
| 1095598273205760 | 1106344962048000 | 1116054323723776 | 1169865026661376 |
| 1193982625752576 | 1205393739641856 | 1306023230777856 | 1321446647858176 |
| 1322785799115776 | 1354937790694400 | 1362512236230656 | 1403765305779200 |
| 1414525386134016 | 1442750574178816 | 1462047228742656 | 1464455125715456 |
| 1470256741009920 | 1501147355115520 | 1508618273958400 | 1509151874228736 |
| 1545486653254656 | 1673159273921536 | 1751929181009920 | 1773132065883136 |

LARGE CARMICHAEL NUMBERS

39

| | | | |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| 1792219606827520 | 1801169257693696 | 1809600760034816 | 1822868658648576 |
| 1830869572354560 | 1888188336528896 | 1906817475696640 | 1924754376675840 |
| 2066467998278656 | 2083233141907456 | 2112382859378176 | 2138835732239360 |
| 2142585870818816 | 2148426115476480 | 2166236827202560 | 2175095827829760 |
| 2179822001652736 | 2185026149463040 | 2199783081263616 | 2210482899811840 |
| 2227701809693696 | 2243652646346240 | 2249277081628160 | 2287863179941376 |
| 2382514905886720 | 2441625557455360 | 2445149070437376 | 2452372761355776 |
| 2453639804468736 | 2538052173875200 | 2538312793312256 | 2555296836665856 |
| 2555404483824640 | 2578461063073280 | 2636155304657920 | 2643268773126656 |
| 2650929748436480 | 2678782034361856 | 2679827087400960 | 2713705038927360 |
| 2735582650011136 | 2823647296943616 | 2869157837374976 | 2893743624348160 |
| 2922247458866176 | 2925749854462976 | 2931026625476096 | 2948193514482176 |
| 2964201522592256 | 2967904275819520 | 2987343086439936 | 3001344427896320 |
| 3025560403099136 | 3108466742398976 | 3168630172879360 | 3308430353358336 |
| 3310023943354880 | 3383736494213120 | 3385928066752000 | 3428237520619520 |
| 3446635913724416 | 3448363418846720 | 3450902655654400 | 3530119118181376 |
| 3535083763939840 | 3560463770620416 | 3563559270258176 | 3567890909518336 |
| 3576095271203840 | 3583617695864320 | 3584503595927040 | 3606803039656960 |
| 3621359098768896 | 3632146477207040 | 3666974711068160 | 3710376603326976 |
| 3741987783820800 | 3788807087077376 | 3935631630960640 | 3936582428353536 |
| 3959970705067520 | 3970616957565440 | 3974616899360256 | 3982594635448320 |
| 3990800027250176 | 3998677842052096 | 4050268129192960 | 4061221356363776 |
| 4066149948049920 | 4073945868601856 | 4082287235762176 | 4083383794611880 |
| 4129656621150720 | 4138572793235456 | 4150642666531840 | 4175937688613376 |
| 4197083402029056 | 4213116647989760 | 4226696115680000 | 4236354012658176 |
| 4248918856861696 | 4256968914989056 | 4296618394541056 | 4306064561488896 |
| 4338412275174400 | 4385030190684160 | 4415990852701696 | 4437986412107776 |
| 4501734647493120 | 4505101067731456 | 4542511803287040 | 4547937941171200 |
| 4584636351269376 | 4636121566542336 | 4642665380668416 | 4695870375191040 |
| 4746652536053760 | 4748040617838080 | 4759328632823296 | 4811835723517440 |
| 4813342783740416 | 4876534756295680 | 4880601655653376 | 4904476662343680 |
| 4915367567475200 | 4928195606406656 | 5026233839859200 | 5051147203832320 |
| 5085605110864896 | 5111138604881920 | 5118006905658880 | 5138730786428416 |
| 5154962329786880 | 5173535842671616 | 5195858464019456 | 5259158598791680 |
| 5259586097077760 | 5275234079522816 | 5306431153243136 | 5424418104910336 |
| 5427191178129920 | 5433943590817280 | 5434177942287360 | 5445534975068160 |
| 5446454353912320 | 5501347194077696 | 5519438612509696 | 5534992854366720 |
| 5625257314768896 | 5633322610746880 | 5635267470419456 | 5681568110092800 |
| 5695256296178176 | 5699654893001216 | 5700130806755840 | 57727272551666176 |
| 5815980266992640 | 5820567375108096 | 5857218399854080 | 5901642167534080 |
| 5916135904606720 | 5980883867911680 | 5993430685079040 | 6008671256506880 |

| | | | |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| 6012150474485760 | 6042469374016000 | 6097102109802496 | 6104042518724096 |
| 6128507782084096 | 6142290738873856 | 6155241361651200 | 6188231352882176 |
| 6190755137944576 | 6239237048993280 | 6265693012203520 | 6327389255815680 |
| 6375784637090816 | 6398408052413440 | 6450480949065216 | 6458907300824576 |
| 6564022948673536 | 6735964304509440 | 6744748621701120 | 6772837319329280 |
| 6774179560935936 | 6782886619401216 | 6830758186511360 | 6859936232181760 |
| 6861252720879616 | 6868731365595136 | 6914154346136576 | 6957444985829376 |
| 6960110411890176 | 6993462489018880 | 7021889064810496 | 7056691030704640 |
| 7060052300361216 | 7077739398125056 | 7085552315596800 | 7175425331785216 |
| 8550768560766141 | 8522851273346280 | 8522851273364036 | |

Table 3

Some m with $rm+1$ prime for $r=6, 12, 18, 36$, and 72 .

| | | | |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| 28606846153216 | 109975736797696 | 116267172417536 | 292710136711680 |
| 322647893191680 | 327652198429696 | 743849593070080 | 975610320524800 |
| 1214425284758016 | 1693385608493056 | 1725800279741440 | 1734716451826176 |
| 1810081824371200 | 2583838270430720 | 2600188792227840 | 3112589268039680 |
| 3132846506101760 | 3318031037758976 | 3437393194756096 | 3570092268162560 |
| 3709980008531456 | 3783406187043840 | 4888937357173760 | 5924788881963520 |
| 6044097472910336 | 6461039126615040 | 6865524613391360 | 6877409580802560 |

REFERENCES

- [1] P.T. BATEMAN and R.A. HORN: A heuristic formula concerning the distribution of prime numbers. *Math. Comp.* **16** (1962), 363—367.
- [2] J. BRILLHART and J.L. SELFRIDGE: Some factorizations of $2^n \pm 1$ and related results. *Math. Comp.* **21** (1967), 87—96.
- [3] J. CHERNICK: On Fermat's simple theorem. *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* **45** (1939), 269—274.
- [4] P. ERDÖS: On pseudoprimes and Carmichael numbers. *Publ. Math. Debrecen.* **4** (1956), 201—206.
- [5] M. KISHORE: On the equation $k\phi(M) = M - 1$. *Not. Amer. Math. Soc.* **22** (1975), A—501—A—502.
- [6] D.H. LEHMER: On Euler's totient function. *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* **38** (1932), 745—757.
- [7] C. POMERANCE: On composite n for which $\phi(n) | n-1$, II. *Pacific J. Math.* **69** (1977), 177—186.
- [8] J.L. SELFRIDGE and M.C. WUNDERLICH: An efficient algorithm for testing large numbers for primality. *Proc. Fourth Manitoba Conference on Numerical Math.* (1974), 109—120.
- [9] S. WEINTRAUB: Seventeen primes in arithmetic progression. *Math. Comp.* **31** (1977), 1030.

- [10] M. YORINAGA: Numerical Computation of Carmichael numbers. Math. J. Okayama Univ. **20** (1978), 151—163.
- [11] J.R. HILL: Large Carmichael numbers with three prime factors. Not. Amer. Math. Soc. **26** (1979), A—374.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS

URBANA, IL 61801 U. S. A.

AND

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES

NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY

DEKALB, IL 60115 U. S. A.

(Received July 24, 1979)