Carbon-substitution dependent multiple superconducting gap of MgB2: A sub-meV resolution photoemission study

S Tsuda, University of Tokyo
T Yokoya, University of Tokyo
T Kiss, Institute of Physical and Chemical Research
T Shimojima, University of Tokyo
S Shin, University of Tokyo
T Togashi, Institute of Physical and Chemical Research
S Watanabe, University of Tokyo
C Zhang, Beijing Center for Crystal R&D
C T. Chen, Beijing Center for Crystal R&D
S Lee, International Superconductivity Technology Center
H Uchiyama, International Superconductivity Technology Center
S Tajima, International Superconductivity Technology Center
N Nakai, Kyoto University
K Machida, Okayama University

This paper is posted at eScholarship@OUDIR : Okayama University Digital Information Repository.
http://escholarship.lib.okayama-u.ac.jp/physics_general/21
Carbon-substitution dependent multiple superconducting gap of MgB$_2$: A sub-meV resolution photoemission study


1 Institute for Solid State Physics, University of Tokyo, Kashiwa, Chiba 277-8581, Japan
2 The Institute of Physical and Chemical Research (RIKEN), Wako, Saitama 351-0198, Japan
3 The Institute of Physical and Chemical Research (RIKEN), Sayo-gun, Hyogo 679-5148, Japan
4 Beijing Center for Crystal R&D, Chinese Academy of Science, Zhongguancun, Beijing 100080, China
5 Superconductivity Research Laboratory, ISTEC, Shinonome, Tokyo 135-0062, Japan
6 Yukiwa Institute, Kyoto University, Kyoto, Kyoto 606-8502, Japan
7 Department of Physics, Okayama University, Okayama, Okayama 700-8530, Japan

(Received 2 February 2005; published 31 August 2005)

“Sub-meV” resolution photoemission spectroscopy was used to study carbon-substitution dependence of the multiple superconducting gap of Mg(B$_{1−x}$C$_x$)$_2$. Two features corresponding to $\sigma$ and $\pi$ gaps are clearly observed in the raw spectra up to carbon concentration $x=0.075$. The observed $x$ dependence of the two gaps shows a qualitatively different behavior: the $\sigma$ gap is proportional to $T_c$ while the $\pi$ gap shows negligible change. Doping as well as temperature dependence can be explained within the two-band mean-field theory. Implications from the present study are discussed.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.72.064527 PACS number(s): 74.70.Ad, 74.25.Jb, 79.60.–i

Superconductivity is a fundamental quantum phenomenon, which was first explained by the Bardeen-Cooper-Schrieffer (BCS) theory for the low transition temperatures ($T_c$) superconductor. Subsequent discoveries of new superconducting materials with higher $T_c$ have made the field continuously attractive. New theories and new materials have motivated the search for higher $T_c$. The discovery of superconductivity in magnesium diboride (MgB$_2$) has thus induced many studies to clarify the superconducting (SC) transition mechanism because it has the highest $T_c$ among intermetallic superconductors. In fact, the $T_c$ of MgB$_2$ ($T_c=39$ K) is even higher than some of the cuprate superconductors, and is also close to the upper limit predicted by the BCS theory. It is now generally accepted that MgB$_2$ has a multiple SC gap, originating in the two types of Fermi surface sheets with very different character, which simultaneously plays an important role for the high $T_c$. Theoretically, a possibility of the multiple SC gap was proposed more than 40 years ago in terms of “two-band superconductivity.” However, further experimental verification is essential for a complete understanding of this unique superconductor. Here, we show carbon-substitution dependence of the two gaps of MgB$_2$ with “sub-meV” resolution photoemission spectroscopy (PES). The result clearly shows two gaps and different substitution dependence for the two gaps. These results confirm theoretical predictions of the two-band superconductivity in MgB$_2$ and also suggest a new road to explore higher-$T_c$ materials.

The crystal structure of MgB$_2$ consists of alternate hexagonal layers of boron and magnesium, respectively. First-principles calculations have indicated that MgB$_2$ is a band metal, where four bands cross the Fermi level ($E_F$). Two of them originate in the boron $2p$ $\sigma$ orbital with a two-dimensional character, namely, the $\sigma$ band, and the other two originate in the boron $2p$ $\pi$ orbital with a three-dimensional character, namely, the $\pi$ band. The calculated band structure is consistent with experimental band structure obtained from angle-resolved PES studies. The transition mechanism is explained by electron-phonon coupling, where the coupling strength depends on the symmetry of the Fermi surface. This two band model, within an Eliashberg theory, has succeeded in explaining the multiplicity of the SC gap qualitatively and the $T_c$ quantitatively. Conventional BCS theory predicts that a reduction of the density of states (DOS) at $E_F$ reduces $T_c$ and the SC gap value. According to band calculations, doping of electrons in MgB$_2$ is supposed to decrease $T_c$ because of a decrease of the total DOS at $E_F$. The hole character $\sigma$ band at $E_F$ would get occupied, and consequently the $\sigma$-band DOS would be reduced by the dopend electrons. In contrast, the DOS at $E_F$ originating in the $\pi$ band is not expected to change significantly.

Chemically doped MgB$_2$ has been studied extensively as listed in Refs. 13–16 for the examples on the carbon substitution case. All the carbon substitution suppresses the $T_c$. For application, lower $T_c$ is not suitable. Nevertheless many studies have been done on the chemical substitution. One of the reasons is giving a perturbation on the electronic structure of MgB$_2$ that gives us further understanding of the SC mechanism. As mentioned above, the electronic state around $E_F$ is composed of two kinds of the electronic state with different symmetry. Those states should be mixed with chemical substitution, which reduces the difference of the two states. This effect is reflected in the SC gap sizes through the interband coupling in the two-band model. Thus systematic study of the SC gap of chemically substituted MgB$_2$, using ultrahigh-resolution photoemission spectroscopy, can reliably and directly reveal the changes in the multiple SC gaps. Moreover, the recent development of laser photoemission spectrometer with a “sub-meV” resolution provides us an opportunity to do a more quantitative and reliable study for...
the multiple gap, including the role of the interband coupling. While tunneling spectroscopy allows observation of the SC gap, it is known to depend on the surface and/or contact conditions very strongly. The ultraviolet laser excited PES is much more bulk sensitive than tunneling spectroscopy and conventional PES with a He lamp because of the higher escape depth of the photoelectron.\textsuperscript{19}

Photoemission measurements were performed on a spectrometer built using a Scienta \textit{R}4000 electron analyzer and an ultraviolet laser (6.994 eV). The energy resolution was set to \(-0.4\) meV. Samples were cooled using a flowing liquid He refrigerator with improved thermal shielding. The pressure of the spectrometer was better than \(1 \times 10^{-10}\) Torr during all the measurements. All the photoemission measurements have been done for \textit{in situ} fractured surfaces. Temperature-dependent spectral changes were confirmed by cycling temperature across \(T_c\). \(E_F\) of samples for high-resolution measurements was referenced to that of a gold film evaporated onto the sample substrate and its accuracy is estimated to be better than \(\pm 0.2\) meV.

Here, we selected carbon substitution for B in MgB\textsubscript{2} to control \(T_c\), and thus modulate the superconductivity. Carbon is the only atom which can replace boron, giving us a unique opportunity to study changes in boron electronic states which plays a crucial role for the superconductivity. Moreover, systematic carbon concentration \((x)\) dependent studies on \(T_c\), the axis length, etc., using single crystals are already available.\textsuperscript{16} The carbon substituted Mg(B\textsubscript{1-x}C\textsubscript{x})\textsubscript{2} polycrystalline samples were synthesized at high-temperature and high-pressure conditions using the same technique described in Ref. 16. The polycrystalline sample was cut to typically \(2 \times 2 \times 2\) mm\textsuperscript{3}, which is much larger than the probing size of \(\sim 0.2\) mm diameter. The \(x\) and \(T_c\)’s used in this study are listed in Table I, where \(x\) values are nominal C concentration and \(T_c\)’s were determined by SQUID measurements. No significant difference between nominal and actual C content was observed from Auger analysis within the accuracy of the analysis.\textsuperscript{16,20,21} The estimated \(T_c\) obtained from PES supposing BCS temperature dependence of the SC gap\textsuperscript{1} is consis-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Carbon concentration ((x))</th>
<th>(T_c) (K)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>35.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.075</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here we selected carbon substitution for B in MgB\textsubscript{2} to control \(T_c\), and thus modulate the superconductivity. Carbon is the only atom which can replace boron, giving us a unique opportunity to study changes in boron electronic states which plays a crucial role for the superconductivity. Moreover, systematic carbon concentration \((x)\) dependent studies on \(T_c\), the axis length, etc., using single crystals are already available.\textsuperscript{16} The carbon substituted Mg(B\textsubscript{1-x}C\textsubscript{x})\textsubscript{2} polycrystalline samples were synthesized at high-temperature and high-pressure conditions using the same technique described in Ref. 16. The polycrystalline sample was cut to typically \(2 \times 2 \times 2\) mm\textsuperscript{3}, which is much larger than the probing size of \(\sim 0.2\) mm diameter. The \(x\) and \(T_c\)’s used in this study are listed in Table I, where \(x\) values are nominal C concentration and \(T_c\)’s were determined by SQUID measurements. No significant difference between nominal and actual C content was observed from Auger analysis within the accuracy of the analysis.\textsuperscript{16,20,21} The estimated \(T_c\) obtained from PES supposing BCS temperature dependence of the SC gap\textsuperscript{1} is consis-
tent with the $T_c$ obtained from SQUID, indicating that inhomogeneous substitution of C in our polycrystalline samples does not give major contribution to the present PES study.

Figure 1 shows “sub-meV” resolution photoemission spectra as a function of $x$ obtained at 3.5 K (superconducting state). In the spectrum for $x=0.0$, we clearly observe two well-separated peaks at 2.6 and 7.1 meV binding energy, which are attributed to SC gaps on the $\pi$ and $\sigma$ bands. Compared with the spectrum obtained using a conventional He discharge lamp (indicated by a black thin line), the quality of the spectrum is drastically improved and the multiplicity of the SC gap is certain because of the marked increase of the energy resolution and the possible increase in the bulk sensitivity. Moreover, no photoemission intensity was observed around $E_F$, directly indicating that MgB$_2$ is a full gap superconductor. As $x$ is increased, the higher binding energy peak shifts clearly while the lower binding energy structure stays nearly the same position. For the measured $x$ concentrations, the two structures do not merge, indicating that Mg(B$_{1-x}$C$_x$)$_2$ has two gaps up to $x=0.075$, consistent with the magnetic torque and tunneling experiments. These observations, which clearly identify the carbon-substituted change in the SC gap from the raw data alone, are very important, demonstrating the advantage of “sub-meV” resolution PES.

To quantitatively estimate the SC gap size, we tried to fit the spectra using the Dynes function. Figure 2(a) shows the $x$ dependence of the gap size at $T=0$ K. The gap sizes at $T=0$ K were determined by an extrapolation from the fitting result using the known BCS temperature dependence of the SC gap. The larger gap, corresponding to the $\sigma$ band, decreases with increasing $x$, while the smaller gap, corresponding to the $\pi$ band, is independent of $x$ within the fitting error up to $x=0.075$. Bussmann-Holder and Bianconi calculated the $x$ dependence of the two gaps for Al substituted case and predicted that the smaller gap increases up to $x=0.2$. The theoretical result is different from the present experiment as well as specific-heat measurements for the Al substituted case. The specific heat measurements for the Al substituted case shows good correspondence of the substitution dependence on the two gaps with the present case. The $x$ dependence of $T_c$, shown in Fig. 2(a) as a solid line seems very similar to that of the larger gap and in contrast to that of the smaller gap. The similar $x$ dependence of the larger gap and
$T_c$ means the reduced gap $2\Delta /k_BT_c$, which is a measure of coupling strength of Cooper pairing, is independent of $x$. In the weak coupling limit, this value is 3.52, which is known as the mean field BCS value. In the present case for the larger gap, this value is 4.1, which is surely larger than the BCS value, and is almost independent to $x$. This result suggests that electron-phonon coupling of the $\sigma$ band is strong and also $T_c$, or, in other words, superconductivity is governed by the $\sigma$ band.

To get further insight into the nature of inter- and intraband couplings, it is useful to compare the experimental result with a simple model. Here we use the multiband BCS theory for the case of multigap superconductivity, discussed by Suhl et al. For the present model, this model is formulated by the following expression:

$$
\Delta_\sigma \left[ 1 - \lambda_{\sigma\sigma} \right] \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\sigma^2}}{2k_BT} = \Delta_\sigma \lambda_{\sigma\sigma} \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\sigma^2}}{2k_BT} \left[ \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\sigma^2}}{2k_BT} \right] e^d_{\sigma},
$$

$$
\Delta_\pi \left[ 1 - \lambda_{\pi\pi} \right] \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\pi^2}}{2k_BT} = \Delta_\pi \lambda_{\pi\pi} \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\pi^2}}{2k_BT} \left[ \tanh \frac{\sqrt{\epsilon^2 + \Delta_\pi^2}}{2k_BT} \right] e^d_{\pi},
$$

where $k_B$ is Boltzmann’s constant and $T$ is temperature. The gap sizes, $\Delta_\sigma$ and $\Delta_\pi$, for given $T$ are determined by solving this simultaneous equation self-consistently. $\lambda_{\sigma\sigma}$ and $\lambda_{\pi\pi}$ are intraband couplings for the larger and smaller gaps. $\lambda_{\sigma\pi}$ and $\lambda_{\pi\sigma}$ are interband couplings between the larger gap and the smaller gap. These are obtained by a formula $\lambda_{ij}=V_{ij}N_i(i,j=\sigma,\pi)$, where $V_{ij}$ is the electron-phonon coupling matrix element and $N_i$ is calculated partial DOS at $E_F$. For simplicity, we assume a rigid band shift of $E_F$ with carbon substitution, which corresponds to electron doping. Then, the model has three independent parameters: $\lambda_{\sigma\sigma}$, $\lambda_{\pi\pi}$, and one of $\lambda_{\sigma\pi}$ or $\lambda_{\pi\sigma}$, which can be determined to reproduce the $T$ dependence of the two gaps for each $x$. In Figs. 2(a) and 2(b), we plot the $x$-dependent and $T$-dependent $\sigma$ and $\pi$ gap values (marks), respectively, together with results using the multiband BCS theory mentioned above. We found that this simple model can reproduce the gap sizes for both the gaps at $T=0$ and their temperature dependence very well. For the calculation, there are four coupling constants (three independent parameters), which are plotted in Fig. 3. From Fig. 3, it is clear that the interband coupling of the $\sigma$ band decreases while the interband coupling increases with increasing $x$. The 20% suppression of the $\lambda_{\sigma\sigma}$ cannot be explained by the DOS at $E_F$ of the $\sigma$ band alone, since the decrease of the calculated DOS at $E_F$ of the $\sigma$ band due to electron doping is estimated to be, at most, 10% for $x=0.075$ within the rigid band model. This suggests that a suppression of the electron-phonon coupling, as discussed from Raman studies, and/or an increase of interband coupling are also responsible for the reduction of $T_c$. Theoretical studies have reported negligible interband coupling effects for the carbon substitution. Very recently, point contact spectroscopy reported carbon substitution dependence of the two SC gaps of MgB$_2$. The result is similar to present result, though the interpretation of the result is different for the smaller gap.

Thus present results confirm the two-band superconductivity of MgB$_2$. Lastly, we would like to comment on an implication for $T_c$ from the two-band model. The multiband model gives $T_c$ by

$$
T_c = \Theta_D \exp (-1/\lambda),
$$

where $\Theta_D$ is the Debye temperature and $\lambda$ is the total coupling constant given by

$$
\lambda = \frac{\lambda_{\sigma\sigma} + \lambda_{\pi\pi}}{2} + \sqrt{\left(\frac{\lambda_{\sigma\sigma} - \lambda_{\pi\pi}}{2}\right)^2 + \lambda_{\sigma\pi}\lambda_{\pi\sigma}}.
$$

If the interband coupling constants are zero, $T_c$ is completely governed by $\lambda_{\sigma\sigma}$. However, if the interband coupling is not zero, $T_c$ will always become larger than the case of $\lambda_{\sigma\sigma}\lambda_{\pi\pi}=0$. Thus the role of the interband coupling is to make $T_c$ higher than the case without interband coupling. In the present case, using obtained parameters, $T_c$ is estimated to be pushed up about 5 K by the interband coupling. Normally, it is believed that a larger electron-phonon coupling, which is necessary for an increase of $T_c$, can also lead to a CDW transition making the system insulating. In MgB$_2$, the existence of the $\pi$ band may play a role in preventing such an instability occurring in the $\sigma$ band with strong electron-phonon coupling. This possibly allows the $\sigma$ band to become a strong coupling superconductor with higher $T_c$. Thus searching a new two-gap superconductor, with strong electron-phonon coupling, is meaningful and hopeful to obtain a much higher $T_c$.

In conclusion, the present study provides a direct observation of the multiple gap and its carbon substitution dependence using the “sub-meV” PES. In addition, it provides a qualitative estimate of the substituted dependence of interband and intraband coupling between the $\sigma$ and the $\pi$ band using a simple two-band model, giving strong verification for the two-band superconductivity in MgB$_2$.

This work was supported by Grant-in-aid from the Ministry of Education, Science, and Culture of Japan. This work was supported by the New Energy and Industrial Technology Development Organization (NEDO) as Collaborative Research and Development of Fundamental Technologies for Superconductivity Applications. S. T. and H. U. thank JSPS for financial support. We thank Professor A. Chainani for valuable discussions and a reading of the manuscript.